SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, I appreciate the statement made by the Prime Minister... *(Interruptions)*... to the extent he does not downright say that 54 or 64 units are going to be closed down as was started by one Minister outside the country. But, Madam... *(Interruptions)* I would like the Prime Minister to kindly listen to me. The most important point is that he is referring the whole matter to the BIFR. But it will take time. Before the issues are being decided by the BIFR, a number of leading public sector units are starving because the money allotted under the Budget has not been advanced to them. I can give specific examples.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): No, please. You cannot make another speech.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Secondly... *(Interruptions)* It is very important, Madam. Let the Prime Minister clarify... *(Interruptions)* The money allotted under the Budget has not been given to them. And even the money allotted for voluntary retirement scheme has not been given to them. Therefore...
(Interruptions)

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदया, कम्युनिस्ट पार्टी के लोग अपना झंडा चढ़ाने के लिए सारी इंडस्ट्रीज को सिक कर रहे हैं...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Pandeyji, please sit down. Let me deal with it. Please sit down.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I impolore upon the Prime Minister... *(Interruptions)*

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय: महोदया, यही लोग उद्योगों में हड़ताल कराते हैं.... (व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Dr. Pandey, please sit down. Let me deal with it.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: Just one minute. Will you listen to me? Madam, Comrade Das Gupta is an inveterate Member. He uses both the public sector and private sector. He has come to me with these specific cases. He is welcome to come because I can't answer him on these specific points on the floor of the House. So, we can use the public forum to discuss policies to compare notes on policies. You can tell us where the policy is wrong. I will defend the policy. I will try to defend it and naturally the House will decide. But, if you go into specific cases, I have no data with me. You can ask a question, the answer will come. You please write a letter to me, the reply will come. I have no problem on that. On whatever you are raising by way of specificity, there can be no general answer. It has to be case-by-case answer only, and nothing else. Please, I am offering you that if there is any matter in which specifically you want to drawn my attention, I am prepared to take the representation from you, hear you out, and do whatever is possible.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Now, we take up the Sick Industrial Companies (Special Provisions) Amendment Bill, 1991. *(Interruptions)* No, no, be has to go now. It will go on for ever. Now, Shri Dalbir Singh.

THE SICK INDUSTRIAL COMPANIES (SPECIAL PROVISIONS) AMENDMENT BILL, 1991

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Now we take up The Sick Industrial Companies (Special Provisions) Amendment Bill.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI DALBIR SINGH): I move:

"That the Bill to amend the Sick Industrial Companies (Special Provisions) Act, 1985, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration."

The question was proposed.

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह (बिहार) : महोदया, मेरा यह क्वेश्चन है कि पब्लिक सेक्टर में जो गड़बड़ी हो रही है ..... (व्यवधान) वह प्रबन्धकों की वजह से हो रही है तो सरकार क्या कर रही है ? (व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): There has been a discussion on this Bill already. Now I am putting it to vote.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): I want to make a submission. I want to seek a clarification because the Prime Minister replied basically to the debate... (*Interruptions*).

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदश) : प्रधान मंत्री तो चले गये हैं..... (व्यवधान) यह क्यों बोल रहे हैं । (व्यवधान) आप सभी लोग इंडस्ट्री को सिक कर रहे हैं । (व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Let me deal with it myself. Let me first hear him.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: The Prime Minister replied to the Bill and to the Short Duration Discussion but his reply to the Bill was a general reply. And despite his general reply, this Bill is being put to vote. What for? If the public sector is not going to be dismantled, if Jawaharlal Nehru's policies are not going to be reversed, then what for has this Bill been brought? (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): What is your point? As I said, Prime Minister had to go; he is leaving for Colombo, and that is why yesterday also it was decided that on account of shortage of time, because already we are extending the session by one day, and because the subject matter covered is more or less the same, there need not be a separate discussion on this Bill, and it will be passed as soon as this discussion is over It was decided yesterday.

SHRI DEPEN GHOSH: What was his reply? Was his reply to the debate on this Bill?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Probably you were not here...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I was here... (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): If you have any question to ask on the Bill, you can ask. Mr. Dalbir Singh is here. Prime Minister has already said that you can approach him for any specific clarification.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: But you are asking Members to vote.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): You can ask your question; the Minister is here.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Prime Minister's reply was in general terms that Jawaharlal Nehru's policy is not going to be reversed. But here what Jawaharlal Nehru could not think of, they are doing through this Bill.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): We agreed that there need not be any discussion on the Bill and that it will be passed after the Prime Minister's reply. That is why I put the Bill to vote after the Prime Minister's reply. Still, if you have any doubt, if you have any clarification to seek, you can ask Mr. Dalbir Singh.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: But you have already asked for voting.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): I permit you; you can ask whatever doubt you have.

SHI DIPEN GHOSH: What is the use of asking a question after the Prime Minister has replied. Is there any Minister who will say anything contrary to what the Prime Minister said in reply?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): As far as I can see, there is the principle of collective responsibility. Minister will answer.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: We are against reference to BIFR.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA (Bihar): Madam, I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Mr. Ghosh, the hon. Minister of State for Finance is here to reply.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: What will he reply. You said that the Prime Minister already replied.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry). The Minister in charge of Banking will reply. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Mr. Ghosh, you heard the Prime Minister's reply.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You declared that the Prime Minister had replied to both the debates.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): I never said that. Kindly see the record. I never said that. In fact, I specifically called the Prime Minister to reply to the discussion on the public sector undertakings, raised by Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: The question is...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Mr. Ghosh, you have heard his reply. The Prime Minister has also said that he could clarify, if there was anything. (*Interruptions*) If you want to ask anything, you can ask the hon. Minister of State for Finance. He is sitting here. Mr. Dalbir Singh is here. You can ask him. (*Interruptions*) Those who want to seek clarifications from Mr. Dalbir Singh, they can do so. We can take up the voting later. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: Madam, I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions*) My point of order is, before you take up the Bill,... (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Can I hear Mr. Mishra please? He is on a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR (Uttar Pradesh): It is only for consideration now. It has not come to the stage of passing. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Dr. Pandey, please sit down. Mr. Mishra is raising a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY: He is wasting the time of the House. The Prime Minister is not here. (*Interruptions*)

DR. NAGEN SAIKIA (Assam): When the Prime Minister was here, Dr. Pandey was silent. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: Madam, my point of order is, I have moved an amendment.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): It will be taken up.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: You cannot pass the Bill without my amendment being considered.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): We will take up your amendment.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: This one point you have disposed of. The second thing is, the Prime Minister has replied to the debate raised by Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta. Now, the Bill is still there. That reply is a separate matter. What I am pointing out is, the Prime Minister, while replying, said clearly that BIFR was not the only solution. He said that he was ready to consider another solution. In that connection, he said 'if you have any suggestions I mean members of this House, you can give me'. Under these circumstances, in view of the Prime Minister's assurance, the Bill should not be proceeded with, because it is a question of Prime Minister's authority. The bill may be kept pending. If you still do it, we will walk out. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): The Prime Minister has replied, but the Bill has to be taken up now.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am on a point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): I cannot allow any more points of order. (*Interruptions*) I cannot allow.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: What did the Prime Minister reply to?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): I have already said it three times.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Has there been any discussion on the Bill?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): I cannot hear you any more. I have heard you. (*Interruptions*) Mr. Mishra, you can move your amendment at the appropriate time.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Has there been any discussion?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Don't interrupt. (*Interruptions*) If you want to speak, you can do so. I do not understand what is the problem. Those who want to speak, are welcome to do so. Anybody who wants to speak, can speak, on the Bill. I have been saying this for the last fifteen minutes. We are merely taking the Bill into consideration now.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Let us go by the rules. Everything cannot be thrown to the winds. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARANJAN): Please do not make those allegations. I have heard you, Mr. Ghosh. If you want to speak, you speak.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Kindly hear me.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): I cannot hear any more points of order. There is an end to this. If you want to speak, you seak, on the Bill.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: It is not a question of my speaking. We have to follow the rules.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): I cannot hear you any more.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: The questions is, whether there has been any discussion.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: Has the Bill been moved?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): The Bill has been moved. Please Speak.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB): The Chair has allowed you to speak.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Mr. Chaturanan Mishra): do you want to speak (*Interruptions*) I told you about the problem. We are going to take up the Appropriation Bill as soon as the vote on this Bill is over. We had agreed yesterday that there was no need of debate on this Bill. This was agreed in order to save time, but if the Members want to speak..

DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): You take up the Appropriation Bill.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): No, we cannot do that.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: According to the Government Legislative Business, the Appropriation Bill is to be taken first. That is half-way gone and the next Bill for consideration and passing is this Sick Industrial Companies Amendment Bill.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): I have repeatedly said that yesterday it was decided that there will be no discussion on this Bill. You were present here and I am not going to repeat it again and again. (*Interruptions*). I am sorry, Dr. Reddy.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am not going to agree.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): You are not called upon to agree. If you want to speak... (*Interruptions*). It is too bad. If was decided...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: It has to be discussed. It is my right. You cannot deny that.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar): It was decided in the Business Advisory Committee meeting yesterday. Your party representative was also there. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Pleased sit down. When I am calling upon you to speak, you are refusing to speak.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am not refusing to speak. I wanted to know whether there will discussion on the Bill or not. You said that the Prime Minister has replied. I enquired how the reply could come, when there was no discussion. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Will you pleased stop shouting, Mr. Ghosh? I have already said at least four time that I did not say what you are accusing me of. If you are not willing to speak, I will call the other person. Your colleagues have said that I did not say that. If you insist on shouting, I am sorry...

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: I want a copy of the amendments.

SHRI MOHD. KHALEELUR RAHMAN (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, in the agenda Appropriation Bill comes first.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): We decided yesterday that this will be taken up.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: Now I move my amendment that at page 1, after line 4, the following clause be inserted, namely...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): Mr. Mishra, the time to move the amendment has not yet come. I thought you were going to speak on the Bill.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: I would like to do it simultaneously. I do not want to take more time.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN): That stage will come later. Then I will call upon you to move your amendment.

[**The Vice-Chairman, (Dr. Nagen Saikia)** in the Chair]

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. NAGEN SAIKIA): Members, it was decided in the Business Advisory Committee meeting that since there were two things one the Bill and the other Discussion on sick industries, no discussion will take place and the Bill will be passed without discussion. It was decided accordingly. Moreover, the Minister has already moved the Bill. He is here.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: He has moved the Bill—I have understood that.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. NAGEN SAIKIA): He has moved the Bill...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: Now, on a point of order I raise this question. Please hear my question...(*Interruptions*).. The Prime Minister, while replying to the debate has stated that he has not it in his mind — BIFR only. That the BIFR may have to be appended or some other sort of thing should be done—and he has asked the Members that they can also suggest something and he was ready to accept it. In view of this, the Government should not proceed with this Bill. This is my case. Please say whether you accept it or not.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. NAGEN SAIKIA): There are two items on the List of Business.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: No, the Prime Minister has just now said....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. NAGEN SAIKIA): The Prime Minister has told...

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: Then where is the question?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. NAGEN SAIKIA): But because of the comments made by the Prime Minister...

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: The Prime Minister is the Government, you know that. We have a parliamentary system and his words are final.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: In view of what the Prime Minister has stated, this Bill is not necessary...(*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. NAGEN SAIKIA): That is your opinion...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: All right, if you don't accept this, then we will walk out and you do whatever you like...(*Interruptions*)

(*At this stage, some hon. Members left the Chamber*)

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE (Maharashtra): There is a complete misconception. ...(*Interruption*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. NAGEN SAIKIA): Let us proceed.

...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE: He said.....(*Interruptions*).. The public sector should be included. That's all...(*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. NAGEN SAIKIA): The question is:

"That the Bill to amend the Sick Industrial Companies (Special Provisions) Act, 1985, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration."

The motion was adopted.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. NAGEN SAIKIA): We shall now take up clause-by-clause consideration of the Bill. There is one amendment by Shri Chaturanan Mishra. He is not here.

Clause 2 was added to the Bill.

Clause 1, the Enacting Formula and the Title were added to the Bill.

SHRI DALBIR SINGH: Sir, I move:

"That the Bill be passed."

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. NAGEN SAIKIA): Now we shall take up the Appropriation Bill. Shri Mohd. Khaleelur Rahman... He is not present. Shri Chaturanan Mishra... Not present. Shri G. Swaminathan.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu): I have already spoken, Sir.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV (Maharashtra): It should be passed without discussion: that would be better. The mood of the House is to pass all the Bills without discussion.

...(*Interruptions*)...

AN HON. MEMBER. They have come back! ... (*Interruptions*) ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. NAGEN SAIKIA): We have taken up the Appropriation Bill. ...(*Interruptions*)... Shri Mohd. Khaleel Rahman.

THE APPROPRIATION (NO. 5) BILL, 1991—Contd.

श्री मोहम्मद खलीलुर्रहमान (आन्ध्र प्रदेश) : जनाब वाइस चेयरमैन साहब, अभी चार-पांच महीने पहले हुकूमत की जानिब से बजट पेश किया गया था और उस वक्त यह कहा गया था कि मुल्क के माहशी और सनती हालात बेहतर होंगे । मगर मुझे अफसोस के साथ कहना पड़ता है कि इन पांच छ महीनों में हमने देखा है कि जो भी इस्टीमेट बजट के जरिये पेश किये गये थे वे बिल्कुल मुकम्मिल तौर पर नाकाम हो चुके हैं । अब फर्टिलाइजर की सब्सिडी के ताल्लुक से एप्रोप्रिएशन में डिमांड की गयी है । मैं यह कहूंगा कि जहां तक फर्टिलाइजर की सब्सिडी का सवाल है इससे हमारे मुल्क का किसान काफी परेशान है और हमारे मुल्क की जिरात काफी मुतासिर हो चुकी है । फर्टिलाइजर की सब्सिडी पिछले कई सालों से चली आ रही थी मगर इंतिहाई अफसोस के साथ कहना पड़ता है कि इस सब्सिडी को यकलख्त खत्म किया गया है । इससे रबी और मार्जिनल लेविल के किसान को काफी परेशानी का सामना करना पड़ रहा है । वह कतन इस काबिल नहीं है कि इतने कीमती दामों में फर्टिलाइजर को खरीद सकें और अपने खेतों में जिरात के लिए इस्तेमाल कर सकें । इससे एक तो किसान की माहशी हालत दिन ब दिन गिरती जा रही है और फिर दूसरा यह है कि जितनी पैदावार होनी चाहिए थी वह फर्टिलाइजर का इस्तेमाल नहीं करने की वजह से नहीं हो रही है । जाहिर है कि जब पैदावार नहीं होगी तो मुल्क की पूरी जो हमारी इक्नामी है वह यकीनन मुतासिर हो जाएगी ।

आज हम देख रहे हैं कि तेल की कीमतें क्या हैं । खाने के तेल की कीमत 40 रुपये से ज्यादा हो चुकी है, चावल महंगा हो चुका है, गेंहू महंगा है, दालें